



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/944,932	08/31/2001	Bernard Tickner	PH39	2267

26841 7590 08/31/2005

MARK P. BOURGEOIS
P.O. BOX 95
OSCEOLA, IN 46561

EXAMINER

PARA, ANNETTE H

ART UNIT PAPER NUMBER

1661

DATE MAILED: 08/31/2005

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary	Application No. 09/944,932	Applicant(s) TICKNER, BERNARD	
	Examiner Annette H. Para	Art Unit 1661	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 06 May 2005.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

Art Unit: 1661

DETAILED ACTION

The answer to the 1.105 Requirement has been received and entered. A typographical error was made in the 1.105 Requirement for Information sent on March 3rd, 2005. In section a and b the recitation "more than one year" was omitted in front of the word "prior".

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Claim 1 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Plant Breeder's Right grant number 03000204 published on January 1, 1996 in the United Kingdom, in view of applicant's admission that 'Charam' was sold in The United Kingdom as early as April 1 1998 (page 3 of reply filed October 18, 2002).

Claim 1 is drawn to an Euphorbia plant named 'Charam'

The cited publication teaches the Euphorbia plant 'Charam'.

In response to the 1.105 Requirement for Information, Applicant admits that first sales of the instant plant took place in the United Kingdom on April 1, 1998. *In re Elsner* the Court of Appeals Federal Circuit states that foreign sales can enable a publication if one skilled in the art would have been able to reproduce the claimed plant without undue experimentation. The reproduction of Euphorbia spp. is clearly explained in the new Royal Horticultural Society Dictionary of Gardening on page 245. On the answer to the 1.105 requirement, applicant states that Euphorbia 'Charam' can only be reproduced asexually by means of cuttings. One skilled in the art would be able to reproduce and propagate the claimed plant without undue experimentation. The Court also states that the sales must not be an isolated solitary occurrence and that they were such of a nature that the public would have known of the invention. For example, the UPOVROM list the applicant Notcutts Nursery. This would indicate that one of ordinary skill in the art would have known where to obtain the claimed plant. By searching the Internet, one of ordinary

Art Unit: 1661

skill in the art, for example, could easily search Notcutts Nursery for their address: Ipswich Road, Woodbridge Suffolk and phone number: 01394 383344 as noted (<http://www.notcutts.co.uk/nurseries/main.htm>). One of ordinary skill in the art would have been able to check the availability of the claimed plant and where to purchase that plant as well as under what name it was sold. However, the breeder is in the business of selling plants and the instant plants could have been obtained at the previously cited address.

Applicant states that Euphorbia 'Charam' was sold under the trade name Euphorbia Redwing. Simply because Applicant changed the name of the plant does not change the fact that one of ordinary skill in the art was able to buy and reproduce the plant. This, in combination with the above-described UPOV application elicits a 102(b). See below for more information.

The claimed Euphorbia variety 'Charam' is described in the Plant Breeder's Right cited above and published more than one year prior to filing in the U.S.

The published grant, application and published proposed denomination are each "printed publications" under 35 U.S.C. 102 because they are accessible to persons concerned with the art to which the document relates. See *In re Wyer*, 655 F.2d 221,226,210 USPQ 790,794 (CCPA 1981). See also MPEP § 2128. For example, UPOV publishes the application number and grant number, date of publication, species of plant and variety denomination for PBR certificates, and copies of the grant are obtainable through the United Kingdom Register of Varieties. Thus information regarding the claimed variety, in the form of the publications noted above, was readily available to interested persons of ordinary skill in the art.

A printed publication can serve as a statutory bar under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) if the reference, combined with knowledge in the prior art, would enable one of ordinary skill in the art to reproduce the claimed plant. *In re LeGrice*, 301 F.2d 929,133 USPQ 365 (CCPA 1962). If one skilled in the art could reproduce the plant from a publicly available source, then a publication describing the plant would have an enabling disclosure. See *Ex parte Thomson*, 24 USPQ2d 1618, 1620 (Bd. Pat. App. & Inter. 1992) ("The issue is not whether the [claimed] cultivar Siokra was on public use or sale in the United States but, rather, whether 'Siokra' seeds were available to a skilled artisan anywhere in the world such that he/she could attain them and make/reproduce the cultivar Siokra disclosed in the cited publications.").

Art Unit: 1661

Since one skilled in the art could reproduce the plant because it was readily available to the public, then the above referenced publications had an enabling disclosure.

Future Correspondence

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Annette H Para whose telephone number is (571) 272-0982. The examiner can normally be reached Monday through Thursday from 5:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

If attempts to reach the Examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the Examiner's supervisor, Andrew Wang, can be reached on (571) 272-0811. The fax number for the organization where the application or proceeding is assigned is (571) 273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only.

For more information about PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov> . Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).


ANNE MARIE GRUNBERG
PRIMARY EXAMINER